

## COLORADO Department of Education

## **Graduation Guidelines Assessment Workgroup Meeting Notes** 1560 Broadway 19<sup>th</sup> Floor Meeting Date: January 26, 2017 Meeting Time: 10:00am-3:00pm

No.	Discussion	Initiator
	In Attendance: Mike Bowers, Jane Chapman Vigil, Floyd Cobb, Jonathan Dings, Mary Kay Dore, Stephani Duke, Fred Franko, Barry Martin, Gerry Olvy, Susan Ortner, Holly Sample, Chris Selle, Patti Turner, Robert Williams, Catherine Wilson, Brad Ray, Tracy Diel, Danielle Johnson, Carl Einhaus, Joe Southcott, Scott Fast, Sarah Heath, Lulu Buck, Kim Caplan, Erika Anderson, Elliott Asp (Facilitator); Sheila Arredondo (guest speaker), Misti Ruthven and Robin Russel (CDE), Cori Hunt (note taker, CDE) Guests: Jef Fugita (Jeffco), Charles Dukes (Aurora), Kim Poast (DPS), Tammy Lawrence (Adams 12),	
	Diana Zakhem (Englewood), Paul Francisco (SD27J), Carl Einhaus (Dept of Higher Ed)	
1.	Welcome and Introductions In September 2015, the Colorado State Board of Education asked CDE to reconvene the Assessment Work Group (AWG) "to determine whether other additions to the menu should be considered by the board 2 years from now, and that such a process be repeated every 2 years after."	Elliott Asp
2.	<ul> <li>Goals</li> <li>Build a common understanding of the graduation guidelines work</li> <li>Understand the charge for the Assessment Work Group (AWG)</li> <li>Organize to do our work (develop norms and decision making process, set meeting schedule, assignments, etc.)</li> <li>Review our understanding of postsecondary workforce readiness</li> </ul>	Misti Ruthven
3.	<ul> <li>Group Norms</li> <li>Participate; be present and contribute</li> <li>Speak your mind; this is a safe space <ul> <li>Nothing shared without agreement from the group</li> <li>No parking lot conversations</li> </ul> </li> <li>Be a problem-solver <ul> <li>Identify both issues/concerns and possible solutions</li> </ul> </li> <li>Honor thoughts of all</li> <li>Self-monitor your balance between listening and speaking</li> <li>Help to ensure that all voices are heard</li> <li>Provide feedback on the process and product</li> </ul>	Elliott Asp
	<ul> <li>This work honors rural and city districts by creating a menu of options that will work for each student in the state.</li> <li>The goal is to reach consensus: "I can support the general view of the group, even if I don't agree with every specific point"</li> <li>If the group cannot reach consensus, the facilitator will make the decision based on the general feeling and thoughts of the group</li> <li>If need be, the AWG can produce a "minority opinion"</li> <li>The Colorado State Board of Education is authorized to make the decision about the updates to the Graduation Guidelines menu. The AWG will make a recommendation to CDE, and CDE staff will take the recommendation to the state board.</li> </ul>	

4.	History and Context for Graduation Guidelines	Misti Ruthven
	<ul> <li>Higher education admission requirements – 2003 (Updated 2014)</li> </ul>	
	<ul> <li>Educational Alignment Council - 2005</li> </ul>	
	<ul> <li>Graduation Guidelines Development Council (GGDC)– 2007</li> </ul>	
	<ul> <li>Definition of postsecondary and work force readiness - 2009 (Updated 2016)</li> </ul>	
	<ul> <li>GGDC Reconstituted – 2012</li> </ul>	
	<ul> <li>Work Groups - 2013, 2014, 2015 &amp; 2017; more than 600 individuals from around the state</li> </ul>	
	were involved in the process of developing the menu and making recommendations	
	State Board Adoption of Guidelines – 2013	
	State Board Update of Guidelines – 2015	
	Since the AWG met in 2014-15, policies have evolved, including <u>HB 1289</u> – the Career Success Pilot	
	Program. Also, in a series of facilitated conversations, hundreds of education and business leaders	
	from across the state revised Postsecondary and Workforce Readiness - <u>PWR Description</u> .	
	nom across the state revised rostsecondary and workforce readiness - <u>rwit Description</u> .	
	Timeline: Graduation Guidelines take effect for the class of 2021. During the 2016-17 academic	
	year, local boards of education are encouraged to review the state board approved Graduation	
	Guidelines and to adopt local graduation requirements that meet or exceed them.	
5.	Graduation Guidelines Menu of Options	Robin Russel
	Robin Russel reviewed the current menu of options for Graduation Guidelines, which provides	
	multiple options for students to demonstrate learning. The State Board of Education approved the	
	menu of options in September 2015, "recognizing that it is the floor not the ceiling." School districts	
	may raise a cut score on an included assessment and may add graduation requirements in other	
	content areas. Districts may offer some or all of the state menu options	
	Less set as hear the and districts callest from the many to create a list of antions that their students	
	<b>Local school boards and districts</b> select from the menu to create a list of options that their students	
	must use to show what they know or can do in order to graduate from high school, beginning with	
	the graduating class of 2021. <b>Students</b> must demonstrate college or career readiness in English and	
	math based on at least one measure.	
	<b>Q</b> How can a student demonstrate competency in English and math with an industry certification?	
	<b>A:</b> Each district has the authority to create the process and criteria for approving industry	
	certifications.	
6.	Guest Speaker	Sheila
	Career and College Readiness, Sheila Arredondo, WestEd	Arredondo
	Sheila divided the AWG into two groups and asked each to write down the skills that a student	
	needs to be 1) career-ready and 2) college-ready. Then the groups rotated to review and add to	
	each other's lists. Their comments were captured on white boards and repeated here:	
	Career-Ready: Problem Solving, Critical Thinking, Teamwork, Communication, Presentation	
	Skills, Resiliency, Financial management, Self-direction, Time management, Relationships,	
	Lifelong learner, Culture competency, Skill technical, Information literacy, Org skills, Reliability ,	
	Dependability	
	College-Ready: Collaboration communication, Creativity, Self-direction, Grit, Academic	
	competencies and rigor, Standardized tests, Type of courses, Ability to navigate educational	
	systems, Critical thinking, self-awareness, Ownership, Ability to navigate educational systems,	
	systems, Critical thinking, self-awareness, Ownership, Ability to navigate educational systems, Accountability	
	Accountability	

	Sheila passed out 1) <u>College and Career Readiness Report Abstracts</u> , Selected Definition Reports, and <u>College and Career Readiness</u> : An Evolving Phrase & Concept."	
	There are "meta" standards that apply to both career and college. According to Dave Conley there are four keys to CCR 1) cognitive strategies, 2) content knowledge 3) learning skills and techniques, 4) transitional knowledge and skills.	
	Most states start with guiding principles/values: What do we want ALL students to know/do, can they effectively communicateand are they globally aware.	
7.	<ul> <li>Update on <u>COLLEGE ADMISSIONS</u></li> <li>Guest Speaker, Carl Einhaus, Director of Student Affairs at the Dep't of Higher Education, reported on updates to college admission standards, approved by the Commission on Higher Education</li> <li>The index of test scores (ACT/SAT) and GPA will be retired in 2018.</li> <li>Institutions are now providing "average score ranges for admitted students." For example, a college could report, "50 percent of admitted students had between a 3.0 – 3.5 GPA, and 1040 – 1300 SAT." The <u>online admission standards tool</u> provides the 50 percent mid-range.</li> <li>This change provides greater transparency as these measures more accurately reflect current admission practices.</li> </ul>	Carl Einhaus
8.	Procedure for Updating the Menu Elliott introduced the procedure for considering updates to the menu: "The AWG will hear presentations from vendors and experts about possible additions or changes to the current menu. Then the group will ask questions of the vendor/presenter and discuss each topic." Elliott passed out a list of possible updates/additions suggested by school and district administrators.	Elliott Asp
	<ul> <li>Discussion/Questions</li> <li>What is a checklist for determining whether an item is on/off the menu?</li> <li>What is the purpose of each "product"?</li> <li>Does it measure skills?</li> <li>What is the validity/reliability?</li> <li>Does it measure readiness or success?</li> <li>Is it a workforce-ready credential?</li> <li>How could prior learning be reflected? (i.e. work experience)</li> </ul>	
9	ACCUPLACER Guest Speaker, Kathie Montognese, Senior Assessment Manager from the College Board, spoke to the group by phone.	College Board
	<ul> <li>ACCUPLACER - current placement exams - include reading comprehension, sentence skills, and math. The exams are multiple choice and computer adaptive (the test adjusts the questions based on student's skill levels).</li> <li>Sentence Skills assess the mechanics of writing</li> <li>Reading Comprehension tests a student's ability to understand and interpret text</li> <li>Math includes continuum of questions, arithmetic to college level math</li> </ul>	
	<ul> <li>ACCUPLACER recently redesigned and added 5 new Next Generation placement exams that include reading, writing, and math. The exams are multiple choice and computer adaptive (the test adjusts the questions based on student's skill levels).</li> <li>Reading measures information and ideas, rhetoric, synthesis, and vocabulary</li> <li>Writing measures expression of ideas and standard conventions of English.</li> <li>Math includes continuum of questions; arithmetic, quantitative reasoning, algebra, statistics, and advance algebra functions.</li> </ul>	

	Questions/Discussion about ACCUPLACER	
	Who sets the cut scores? A: (Kathie and Sarah Heath) Colleges set the scores based on	
	their curriculum.	
	• Is there an appetite for setting/changing cut scores? A: (Sarah Heath) Community colleges	
	have begun conversations about cut scores and pre-requisites.	
	<ul> <li>Participants asked about the COMMUNITY COLLEGE PLACEMENT TEST (CCPT), which Community Colleges had begun using as a placement assessment.</li> <li>Sarah Heath announced that, as of January 25, the Community College System (CCCS) terminated the contract entered into with McCann Associates for the Community College Placement Test (CCPT).</li> <li>The ACCUPLACER will revert to the main assessment tool at the Community College System, and students will no longer be assessed by the CCPT; therefore the CCPT will not be discussed as a possible addition to the menu</li> </ul>	Sarah Heath
10.	CLEP Exams (College Level Examination Program) Guest Speaker: Kathie Montognese, College Board, continued her presentation by phone:	College Board
	<ul> <li>Validates knowledge that students have already learned and translates that knowledge into college credit</li> </ul>	
	<ul> <li>Originally designed for the working adult, now is also common for more traditional students, including rural communities that do not have AP</li> </ul>	
	• CLEP is scored on a scale from 20-80. American Council of Education (ACE) recommends a	
	score of 50 for awarding credit. A 50 is the equivalent of earning a C in the course.	
	<ul> <li>200,000 exams last year (1/3 military)</li> </ul>	
	Benefits: saves time and money for students, keeps them engaged in higher-level courses	
	<ul> <li>CLEP is \$80/test – Some testing centers charge administration fees (\$20)</li> </ul>	
	Questions (answered by Kathie unless otherwise noted):	
	• What's the difference between AP and CLEP? AP is a course and exam program that offers challenging college-level course content in high school and an opportunity to earn college credit, advanced placement, or both. CLEP is a credit-by-exam program that lets students demonstrate mastery of college-level material, regardless of where they acquired the relevant knowledge.	
	<ul> <li>Who sets recommended cut scores? American Education Council (ACE) sets the recommended score to award credit a score of 50 is equivalent to the grade "C". States may vary somewhat in terms of what score is appropriate to accept.</li> </ul>	
	<ul> <li>Are there situations where CLEP can determine (college) readiness vs success? No, CLEP exams do not demonstrate readiness for a course but rather that a student demonstrates knowledge of information in a college course</li> </ul>	
	<ul> <li>Can a high school get set up to do CLEP testing? Yes, the test is web-based, so any district could get set up – virtually. For example, DPS has test centers. In Colorado many test centers are at community colleges and universities.</li> </ul>	
	<ul> <li>Is there a CLEP test in Spanish? Yes, #1 test across the country and has been used for ASCENT qualification</li> </ul>	
	<ul> <li>Do students get college credit? Yes, but it's up to the college</li> </ul>	
	Can districts absorb the cost of the test? Yes	
	<ul> <li>Does a CLEP test follow the natural progression of a course? Great to take an exam, but what's the purpose? Will a student get credit? Where? (Answer from Sarah Heath, CCCS) At the Community College level, CLEP tests are converted to credit for college classes.</li> </ul>	

	<ul> <li>CLEP Program Team from the College Board answered these questions after the meeting:</li> <li>Is there an equivalent score for CLEP as 2 on AP? There is no equivalent or corresponding score from AP to CLEP. " The CLEP program team recommends a score of 50 for all 33 CLEP exams. A test score of 50 would be the equivalent of receiving a grade of C in a college course."</li> <li>What is the difference between SAT subject exams and CLEP exams? "SAT subject tests are focused on high school, and CLEP is focused on introductory college level course content."</li> <li>There have been 60 years of testing. How has the test evolved? What are the drivers of evolution? "Because the CLEP exams are equivalent to introductory college courses, the exams evolved over the last 50 years to stay aligned with those college courses. The primary driver of evolution would be the changes occurring in college classrooms. Periodically we conduct curriculum surveys for all CLEP exams to learn about the content coverage and recent trends for a typical college course. We also receive feedback from other sources, such as from the faculty members serving on the standing test development committees and faculty who help set the standard for an exam."</li> <li>If districts were to administer the test, would they have access to reduced costs? "Yes districts can pay for the tests (\$80 per test) and can purchase voucher codes in bulk. This would eliminate the administrative fee pd at higher ed institutions District receives voucher codes and then an invoice as codes are used. For more information about the Bulk Voucher Program please click here."</li> </ul>	College Board
	<ul> <li>Discussion/comments (about CLEP)</li> <li>Do not see CLEP adding additional benefit. The demographic is covered by other options.</li> <li>Students with CLEP credit get college credit for a course(also from out of state)</li> <li>CLEP was not designed for students to demonstrate readiness in college or career competencies. It's a stretch.</li> <li>The more assessment options the better.</li> <li>There are plenty of equivalent options of the college side (CLEP included). We need more from the career side.</li> <li>A longer list is overwhelming. We must provide resources to the field.</li> <li>Find out which Colorado districts are using CLEP. What training do they use? How do they implement the test?</li> <li>I'm looking at the website now, there are six different English Composition tests!</li> <li>Can we bring back the discussion later – with more information?</li> </ul>	Elliott
11	<ul> <li>DISCUSSION ABOUT ADDITIONS/UPDATES TO THE MENU</li> <li>Sarah Heath (CCCS) offered to make a presentation about and assessment called, Career Pathways or CPass.</li> <li>Elliott asked the group about High School Equivalency (HSE). Jef Fugita (Jeffco) said that several schools in Jeffco work with students to complete the GED (one of three HSE assessments). HSE is an important assessment option for alternative students. Need more information. Will add to future meeting agenda.</li> <li>Need more time to unpack Industry Certifications</li> <li>Bring in districts to talk about how they're implementing Capstone. What is defined as "rigor"? Is a Capstone acceptable to colleges?</li> <li>Several districts brought up the importance of GPA as an indicator for college success. The intent of the Graduation Guidelines menu is to step outside of course work and grades to discover other indicators of students' success can be, beyond grades – measures from assessments approved and practiced by business, colleges, and the military</li> <li>The Collaboratively-developed, standards-based performance assessment has been assigned to a CDE staff person who will bring updates about the development of the process to the AWG at future meetings.</li> </ul>	Elliott

•	There are multiple assessments that individual industries use to test skills and competencies. And state agencies and businesses are collaborating to develop resources	
	and tools for students	
What	could have worked better in the meeting?	
•	More in-person presenters	
•	Review each topic in advance – homework for the group	
•	Focused set of questions up front, answered by each presenter	
•	Small group work to discuss topics, then report out so more detail emerges	
•	Recruit industry and sector partnership practitioners	
•	Discuss implementation practices	
•	Post everything on the <u>CDE Assessment Work Group webpage</u>	
Next I	Meetings:	
Thurs	<b>day, March 2, 10-3</b> , same place: 1560 Broadway, 19 <sup>th</sup> Floor	
	day, April 27, 10-3, TBA	
	day, June 8, 10-3, TBA	
Meeti	ng was adjourned at 2:45 p.m.	